

XAVIER BECERRA  
 Attorney General of California  
 MARK R. BECKINGTON  
 ANTHONY R. HAKL  
 Supervising Deputy Attorneys General  
 GABRIELLE D. BOUTIN, SBN 267308  
 TODD GRABARSKY, SBN 286999  
 R. MATTHEW WISE, SBN 238485  
 ANNA T. FERRARI, SBN 261579  
 Deputy Attorneys General  
 1300 I Street, Suite 125  
 P.O. Box 944255  
 Sacramento, CA 94244-2550  
 Telephone: (415) 510-3779  
 Fax: (916) 324-8835  
 E-mail: Anna.Ferrari@doj.ca.gov  
*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of California, by and  
 through Attorney General Xavier Becerra*

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
 FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

**STATE OF CALIFORNIA by and through  
 Attorney General Xavier Becerra;  
 COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES; CITY OF  
 LOS ANGELES; CITY OF FREMONT;  
 CITY OF LONG BEACH; CITY OF  
 OAKLAND; CITY OF STOCKTON,**

Plaintiffs,

**v.**

**WILBUR L. ROSS, JR., in his official  
 capacity as Secretary of the U.S.  
 Department of Commerce; U.S.  
 DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE; RON  
 JARMIN, in his official capacity as Acting  
 Director of the U.S. Census Bureau; U.S.  
 CENSUS BUREAU; DOES 1-100,**

Defendants.

3:18-cv-01865

**STIPULATION AND [PROPOSED]  
 ORDER FOR LEAVE TO CONDUCT  
 TRIAL DEPOSITION OF EXPERT  
 WITNESS PAMELA KARLAN;  
 DECLARATION OF ANNA T.  
 FERRARI; DECLARATION OF  
 PAMELA S. KARLAN**

Dept: 3  
 Judge: The Honorable Richard G.  
 Seeborg  
 Trial Date: January 7, 2019  
 Action Filed: March 26, 2018

Case No. 5:18-cv-02279

**CITY OF SAN JOSE, a municipal  
corporation; and BLACK ALLIANCE FOR  
JUST IMMIGRATION, a California Non-  
Profit Corporation,**

Plaintiffs,

**v.**

**WILBUR L. ROSS, JR., in his official  
capacity as Secretary of the U.S.  
Department of Commerce; U.S.  
DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE; RON  
JARMIN, in his official capacity as Acting  
Director of the U.S. Census Bureau; U.S.  
CENSUS BUREAU,**

Defendants.

**STIPULATION FOR LEAVE TO CONDUCT TRIAL DEPOSITION OF EXPERT  
WITNESS PAMELA KARLAN**

Plaintiffs, Plaintiff-in-Intervention, and Defendants in the cases of *California et al. v. Ross et al.*, 18-cv-1865 and *San Jose et al. v. Ross et al.*, 18-cv-2279, hereby stipulate as follows:

1. The parties seek an order pursuant to Civil Local Rule 6-2 to conduct a *de bene esse* deposition of the Plaintiffs' expert witness, Professor Pamela Karlan, and to modify the discovery deadline as needed in order to do so, in light of Professor Karlan's unavailability to appear during trial.

2. Professor Karlan is the Kenneth and Harle Montgomery Professor of Public Interest Law at Stanford Law School and has offered expert testimony on behalf of Plaintiffs regarding whether the addition of a citizenship question to the decennial census would assist the Department of Justice in enforcing section 2 of the Voting Rights Act. Declaration of Pamela S. Karlan ("Karlan Decl.") ¶¶ 1-3.

3. Professor Karlan has submitted an expert report on behalf of Plaintiffs that was timely disclosed to Defendants on September 19, 2018. Declaration of Anna Ferrari ("Ferrari Decl.") ¶ 2. Defendants deposed Professor Karlan on October 25, 2018, in Palo Alto, California. *Id.* ¶ 3.

4. For the first three months of 2019, Professor Karlan will be traveling abroad to satisfy a professional commitment associated with her teaching duties, thereby rendering her unavailable to appear at trial in San Francisco.<sup>1</sup> Karlan Decl. ¶¶ 4-6.

<sup>1</sup> Federal courts have determined that travel by a local witness to a location beyond 100 miles from the trial site can render that witness unavailable for trial within the meaning of Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 32(a)(4)(B) ("A party may use for any purpose the deposition of a witness, whether or not a party, if the court finds: . . . that the witness is more than 100 miles from the place of hearing or trial or is outside the United States, unless it appears that the witness's absence was procured by the party offering the deposition. . . ."). See, e.g., *Torres v. Transguard Ins. Co. of Am. Inc.*, No. CV-13-01578-PHX-ROS, 2015 WL 12632029, \*5 (D. Ariz. June 26, 2015) (permitting trial deposition of eyewitness who, although within the court's subpoena power, planned to be more than 100 miles from the trial site during trial); *MMG Ins. Co. v. Samsung Electronics America, Inc.*, 293 F.R.D. 58, 67 (D.N.H. 2013) (permitting use of deposition at trial because witness's vacation plans more than 100 miles from trial site rendered him unavailable under Rule 32); *Branning v. Wayne County*, No. 3:15-cv-1936, 2018 WL 1998312, \*2 (permitting use of deposition at trial of a local witness who had international travel plans during trial).

1           5.       Professor Karlan's commitment to teach this course predates this action, and no  
2 party or party's counsel procured her absence during trial. Karlan Decl. ¶¶ 7-8. Professor Karlan  
3 has been a faculty member at this program for several years before this action was filed. *Id.*

4           6.       The parties and Professor Karlan have preliminarily agreed to conduct her trial  
5 deposition on December 18, 2018, in Washington, D.C., which will spare Defendants the expense  
6 and inconvenience of traveling to California for a further deposition. Ferrari Decl. ¶ 4.

7           7.       The proposed deposition date would precede the final pretrial conference on  
8 January 3, 2019, ECF No. 79 at 2, and provide sufficient time in advance of trial for the parties to  
9 designate Professor Karlan's testimony and interpose objections to such designations.

10          8.       Although a number of federal courts have determined that a *de bene esse*  
11 deposition is not subject to the same timing limitations as a deposition for the purpose of  
12 discovery,<sup>2</sup> in an abundance of caution, the parties hereby seek leave of court to re-open the  
13 discovery period should the Court find it necessary to do so for this limited purpose. Professor  
14 Karlan's unavailability due to her teaching commitment abroad would provide good cause to do  
15 so.

16               **IT IS SO STIPULATED.**

17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23

---

24               <sup>2</sup> *De bene esse* depositions "are used at trial in lieu of live testimony, and are not  
25 discovery tools," *Holen v. Jozic*, No. C17-1147JLR, 2018 WL 5761775, \*4, n. 4 (W.D. Wash.  
26 Nov. 2, 2018). Accordingly, federal courts have determined that trial depositions need not be  
27 confined to the discovery period. *See, e.g., Charles v. Wade*, 665 F.2d 661, 664 (5th Cir. 1982)  
28 (district court erred in denying trial deposition due to close of discovery period because "the  
requested deposition would not have been taken for purposes of discovery but as the testimony of  
a witness unavailable for trial"); *Spangler v. Sears, Roebuck and Co.*, 138 F.R.D. 122, 124 (S.D.  
Ind. 1991) (close of discovery "does not prevent a party from memorializing a witness' testimony  
in order to offer it at trial"); *Estenfelder v. Gates Corp.*, 199 F.R.D. 351, 352-356 (D. Colo. 2001).

1 Dated: November 30, 2018

Respectfully submitted,

2  
3 XAVIER BECERRA  
Attorney General of California  
4 MARK R. BECKINGTON  
ANTHONY R. HAKL  
Supervising Deputy Attorneys General  
5 GABRIELLE D. BOUTIN  
TODD GRABARSKY  
6 R. MATTHEW WISE  
Deputy Attorneys General  
7

8 /s/ Anna T. Ferrari  
ANNA T. FERRARI  
9 Deputy Attorney General  
Attorneys for Plaintiff State of California, by and  
10 through Attorney General Xavier Becerra

11 Dated: November 30, 2018

/s/ Charles L. Coleman  
12 CHARLES L. COLEMAN III, SBN 65496  
DAVID I. HOLTZMAN  
13 HOLLAND & KNIGHT LLP  
50 California Street, 28<sup>th</sup> Floor  
14 San Francisco, CA 94111  
Telephone: (415) 743-6970  
15 Fax: (415) 743-6910  
Email: charles.coleman@hklaw.com  
16 Attorneys for Plaintiff County of Los Angeles  
17

18 Dated: November 30, 2018

MIKE FEUER  
City Attorney for the City of Los Angeles

19 /s/ Valerie Flores  
20 VALERIE FLORES, SBN 138572  
Managing Senior Assistant City Attorney  
21 200 North Main Street, 7th Floor, MS 140  
Los Angeles, CA 90012  
22 Telephone: (213) 978-8130  
Fax: (213) 978-8222  
23 Email: Valerie.Flores@lacity.org  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

1  
2 Dated: November 30, 2018

HARVEY LEVINE  
City Attorney for the City of Fremont

3 /s/ Harvey Levine  
4 SBN 61880  
5 3300 Capitol Ave.  
6 Fremont, CA 94538  
7 Telephone: (510) 284-4030  
8 Fax: (510) 284-4031  
9 Email: hlevine@fremont.gov

10  
11 Dated: November 30, 2018

CHARLES PARKIN  
City Attorney for the City of Long Beach

12 /s/ Michael J. Mais  
13 MICHAEL K. MAIS, SBN 90444  
14 Assistant City Attorney  
15 333 W. Ocean Blvd., 11th Floor  
16 Long Beach CA, 90802  
17 Telephone: (562) 570-2200  
18 Fax: (562) 436-1579  
19 Email: Michael.Mais@longbeach.gov

20  
21 Dated: November 30, 2018

BARBARA J. PARKER  
City Attorney for the City of Oakland  
MARIA BEE  
Chief Assistant City Attorney

22 /s/ Erin Bernstein  
23 ERIN BERNSTEIN, SBN 231539  
24 Supervising Deputy City Attorney  
25 MALIA MCPHERSON  
26 Deputy City Attorney  
27 City Hall, 6th Floor  
28 1 Frank Ogawa Plaza  
Oakland, California 94612  
Telephone: (510) 238-3601  
Fax: (510) 238-6500  
Email: ebernstein@oaklandcityattorney.org

Dated: November 30, 2018

JOHN LUEBBERKE  
City Attorney for the City of Stockton

/s/ John Luebberke  
SBN 164893  
425 N. El Dorado Street, 2nd Floor  
Stockton, CA 95202  
Telephone: (209) 937-8333  
Fax: (209) 937-8898  
Email: John.Luebberke@stocktonca.gov

1 Dated: November 30, 2018

DANNIS WOLIVER KELLEY  
SUE ANN SALMON EVANS  
KEITH A. YEOMANS

3 /s/ Keith A. Yeomans  
4 KEITH A. YEOMANS  
5 *Attorneys for Plaintiff-Intervenor*  
*Los Angeles Unified School District*

6 Dated: November 30, 2018

**MANATT, PHELPS & PHILLIPS, LLP**

7 By: /s/ Andrew Case  
8 John F. Libby  
9 John W. McGuinness  
10 Emil Petrossian  
11 Andrew Case (*pro hac vice*)  
12 11355 West Olympic Boulevard  
Los Angeles, California 90064  
Telephone: (310) 312-4000  
Facsimile: (310) 312-4224

**LAWYERS' COMMITTEE FOR CIVIL RIGHTS  
UNDER LAW**

13 Kristen Clarke  
14 Jon M. Greenbaum  
15 Ezra D. Rosenberg  
16 Dorian L. Spence  
17 1401 New York Avenue NW, Suite 400  
Washington, DC 20005  
Telephone: (202) 662-8600  
Facsimile: (202) 783-0857

**PUBLIC COUNSEL**

18 Mark Rosenbaum  
19 610 South Ardmore Avenue  
20 Los Angeles, California 90005  
21 Telephone: (213) 385-2977  
Facsimile: (213) 385-9089

**CITY OF SAN JOSE**

22 Richard Doyle, City Attorney  
23 Nora Frimann, Assistant City Attorney  
24 Office of the City Attorney  
25 200 East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor  
San José, California 95113-1905  
26 Telephone Number: (408) 535-1900  
Facsimile Number: (408) 998-3131  
E-Mail: cao.main@sanjoseca.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

27 CITY OF SAN JOSE and BLACK ALLIANCE FOR  
28 JUST IMMIGRATION

1 Dated: November 30, 2018

JOSEPH H. HUNT  
Assistant Attorney General

3 BRETT A. SHUMATE  
Deputy Assistant Attorney General

5 CARLOTTA P. WELLS  
Assistant Branch Director

6 /s/ Kate Bailey  
KATE BAILEY  
7 STEPHEN EHRLICH  
CAROL FEDERIGHI  
8 DANIEL HALAINEN  
Trial Attorneys  
9 United States Department of Justice  
Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch  
10 1100 L Street NW  
Washington, DC 20530  
11 Phone: (202) 514-9230  
Email: kate.bailey@usdoj.gov  
12 *Attorneys for Defendants*

13  
14 **ATTESTATION REGARDING ELECTRONIC SIGNATURES**

15 I, Anna T. Ferrari, attest that all signatories listed, and on whose behalf the filing is  
16 submitted, concur in the filing's content and have authorized the filing.

17  
18 Dated: December 3, 2018

/s/ Anna T. Ferrari



**DECLARATION OF ANNA T. FERRARI**

I, Anna T. Ferrari, declare as follows:

1. I am a Deputy Attorney General with the California Department of Justice, duly licensed to practice law in the State of California. I am counsel of record in this action for the State of California. I make this declaration in support of the parties' Stipulation for Leave to Conduct Trial Deposition of Pamela Karlan. I have personal knowledge of the facts stated herein and, if called upon to do so, could and would testify competently thereto.

2. Professor Karlan, Plaintiffs' expert witness, has submitted an expert report in this action that was disclosed to Defendants on September 19, 2018.

3. Defendants deposed Professor Karlan on October 25, 2018, in Palo Alto, California.

4. Prior to filing this stipulation, counsel for Plaintiffs and Defendants conferred and agreed to conduct Professor Karlan's trial deposition on December 18, 2018, in Washington, D.C., should the Court grant leave to do so.

5. The Court has granted one previous time modification in this case, extending the close of expert discovery from October 11, 2018, to October 26, 2018.

6. The request to reopen discovery for the purpose of conducting Professor Karlan's trial deposition would have no impact upon the scheduling of the case, including its January 7, 2019, trial date.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed on November 30, 2018 at San Francisco, California.

/s/ Anna T. Ferrari

Anna T. Ferrari

**DECLARATION OF PAMELA S. KARLAN**

I, Pamela S. Karlan, declare as follows:

1. I am the Kenneth and Harle Montgomery Professor of Public Interest Law at Stanford Law School. I make this declaration in support of the parties' Stipulation for Leave to Conduct Trial Deposition of Pamela Karlan. I have personal knowledge of the facts stated herein and, if called upon to do so, could and would testify competently thereto.

2. My scholarly specialty is constitutional law and litigation, with a special emphasis on legal regulation of the political process.

3. I have offered expert testimony in this action on behalf of Plaintiffs regarding whether the addition of a citizenship question to the decennial census would assist the Department of Justice in enforcing section 2 of the Voting Rights Act.

4. As part of my official duties at Stanford Law School, I have committed to teach a course for the Bing Overseas Studies Program in Italy during the 2019 winter term.

5. In order to teach at the Bing Overseas Studies Program, I will leave the United States on January 2, 2019, and return to the United States on March 22, 2019.

6. I will be unable to appear in person at trial in San Francisco during this period.

7. This is my second time teaching in this program, and I committed to teach at the program more than 18 months ago, before this action was filed.

8. No party or party's counsel procured my participation on this faculty of the Bing Overseas Studies Program.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed on December 3, 2018 at Palo Alto, California.

/s/ Pamela S. Karlan  
Pamela S. Karlan

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**[PROPOSED] ORDER**

Based on the parties’ Stipulation for Leave to Conduct Trial Deposition of Expert Witness Pamela Karlan, and good cause appearing, this Court finds that Plaintiffs’ expert witness Pamela Karlan is unavailable for trial within the meaning of Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 32(a)(4)(B) in light of prior teaching commitments abroad. Accordingly, the parties may depose Professor Karlan at a mutually convenient time and location in advance of trial in order to preserve her trial testimony.

**PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED.**

DATED: \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
HON. RICHARD SEEBORG  
United States District Court Judge